SOURCEBOOK ON

MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE

Professor B.M. Dickens

1992/93

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
SOURCEBOOK ON
MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE

Professor B.M. Dickens
1992/93

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART I</th>
<th>COURSE OUTLINE</th>
<th>1.1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PART II</td>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART III</td>
<td>TEXTS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Medical Protective Association: Revenue Statement and Statistical Summary</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patients' Interests and Clients' Wishes: Physicians and Lawyers in Discord</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Modern Law of Informed Consent</td>
<td>3.11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Doctrine of &quot;Informed Consent&quot;: Informed Choice in Medical Care</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informed Consent and Novel Treatment</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Treatment of Minors</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adolescents and Medical Care Decisions</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Modern Function and Limits of Parental Rights</td>
<td>3.47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is a Medical Experiment?</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Rights in Medical Experimentation</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of the Commission of Inquiry into the Confidentiality of Health Information: Recommendations - Horace Krever</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Protection of Psychiatric Confidentiality</td>
<td>3.111</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Right to Natural Death</td>
<td>3.138</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision-Making in Terminal Care: The Days of One's Life and the Life of One's Days</td>
<td>3.155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refusal of Life-Sustaining Medical Care</td>
<td>3.167</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Approaches to Genetic Counselling</td>
<td>3.172</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Laws for New Knowledge?</td>
<td>3.176</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abortion, Amniocentesis and the Law</td>
<td>3.178</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal-Fetal Conflict</td>
<td>3.189</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Issues in Embryo and Fetal Tissue Research and Therapy</td>
<td>3.194</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prenatal Diagnosis and Female Abortion: A Case Study in Medical Law and Ethics</td>
<td>3.206</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Evolution of the Concept of Brain Death</td>
<td>3.208</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Issues Pertaining to the Role of the Family in Organ Retrieval</td>
<td>3.212</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal and Ethical Issues in Buying and Selling Organs</td>
<td>3.216</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Anencephalic Organ Donor and the Law</td>
<td>3.221</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Vitro Fertilization - Legal and Ethical Issues</td>
<td>3.225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Abuse and Criminal Process: Dilemmas in Punishment and Protection</td>
<td>3.231</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Withholding Paediatric Medical Care: Re Superintendent of Family &amp; Child Service &amp; Dawson et al.</td>
<td>3.240</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Contraceptive Sterilization of the Mentally Retarded: The Dawn of &quot;Eve&quot;</td>
<td>3.248</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Comment - Eve v. E.</td>
<td>3.251</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparative Law and Legislation on Eugenic Sterilization and Selective Abortion</td>
<td>3.259</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report of the Committee of Inquiry into Human Fertilization and Embryology: Recommendations - Dame Mary Warnock</td>
<td>3.269</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproduction Law and Medical Consent</td>
<td>3.279</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sperm, Ovum and Embryo Transplantation and Surrogate Motherhood</td>
<td>3.296</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enforcement of Surrogate Motherhood Agreements</td>
<td>3.301</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Rights and Duties in the AIDS Epidemic</td>
<td>3.306</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing AIDS Patients</td>
<td>3.313</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Limits of AIDS Confidentiality</td>
<td>3.318</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Medical Malpractice Problem in the United States and Canada</td>
<td>3.321</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrongful Birth and Life, Wrongful Death Before Birth, and Wrongful Law</td>
<td>3.326</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Anencephalic Organ Donor and the Law</td>
<td>3.343</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Developments in Terminal Care</td>
<td>3.347</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medico-Legal Issues Concerning the Elderly - An Overview</td>
<td>3.352</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal and Medical Professional Orientations</td>
<td>3.366</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abortion and Distortion of Justice in the Law</td>
<td>3.372</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morals and Markets in Transplantatable Organs</td>
<td>3.384</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control of Excised Tissues Pending Implantation</td>
<td>3.389</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who Legally Owns and Controls Human Organs after Procurement</td>
<td>3.394</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Tissue and Organ Donors and Property Law: More on Moore</td>
<td>3.399</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality and the Duty to Warn</td>
<td>3.410</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Issues in <em>In Vitro</em> Fertilization</td>
<td>3.419</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Prichard Report-Liability and Compensation in Health Care</td>
<td>3.425</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effects of Legal Liability on Physicians’ Services</td>
<td>3.461</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctors and Conflicts of Interest</td>
<td>3.489</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Legal and Ethical Implications of Genetic Predictability</td>
<td>3.496</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Letting Die to Inducing Death-The Legal Transition</td>
<td>3.502</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparative Judicial Embryology: Judges’ Approaches to Unborn Human Life</td>
<td>3.509</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproductive Technology and the ‘New’ Family</td>
<td>3.516</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Issues in Epidemiological Studies</td>
<td>3.527</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART IV LEGISLATION

Child & Family Services Act, 1984  S.O. 1984, c. 55, as amended (excerpts) 4.1

Human Tissue Gift Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 210, as amended 4.12

Mental Health Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 262, as amended (December 1987) 4.15

Mental Incompetency Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 264, as amended (August 1988) (excerpts) 4.38

Regulation 448, R.R.O. 1980 (General) under the Health Disciplines Act (excerpt, as amended) 4.40

Health Disciplines Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 196 (excerpt) 4.42

Regulation 518/88, (Hospital Management) under the Public Hospitals Act, R.S.O. 1980 c. 410 (excerpts, as amended) 4.43


Regulation 161/84 (Designation of Communicable Diseases) under the Health Protection & Promotion Act, 1983 4.55

Regulation 162/84 (Designation of Reportable Diseases) under the Health Protection & Promotion Act, 1983 4.56

Regulation 292/84 (Communicable Diseases - General) under the Health Protection & Promotion Act, 1983 4.57

Powers of Attorney Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 386, as amended 4.59

Equality Rights Statute Law, S.O. 1986, c. 64 (excerpts) 4.61

Criminal Code of Canada (excerpts) 4.62

Ontario Bill 108 (1991) 4.78

Ontario Bill 109 (1991) 4.117

Ontario Bill 110 (1991) 4.142
PART I

COURSE OUTLINE

Medical Jurisprudence is offered as a lecture course, but its structure is kept loose in order to accommodate class discussion and/or seminar presentations from interested students. Students are encouraged, but not required, to give seminars; those writing term papers may find it useful to present their work in progress to the rest of the class for comment, perspective and provisional assessment. Evaluation in the course will be based on the term paper (which satisfies the law school's writing requirement), on a final examination or on a take-home assignment, at the student's option. In exceptional circumstances a longer term paper, for three hours' credit, can be arranged.

Students are advised to pay careful initial attention to the lists of recent articles that follow (Part II, infra.). They indicate significant topics addressed in the literature and the thematic dimensions of medical jurisprudence itself, disclosing well-trodden paths still worthy of pursuit, new matters coming to attention and points of interest available for further exploration. The whole list should be read soon after acquisition. It is divided into subject areas, but they are only general and provisional. Most articles affect a number of issues and may be of use in a number of differently directed studies.

A firm sequence of topics to be addressed in class cannot be predetermined; much will depend on the interests of class members and on the subjects chosen for any seminar presentations. The sequence below may, however, serve as a loose model.

- medical negligence and malpractice -- background issues
- malpractice litigation and the law
- informed patient decision-making
- medical treatment of minors
- confidentiality
- the right to die: natural death, non-treatment decisions (defective newborns, severely injured patients, etc.)
- legally protected life, wrongful birth and wrongful life
- criteria for the determination of death: brain death
- medical experimentation
- transplantation law and the control of body materials
- reproduction control, including contraception, sterilization and abortion
- reproduction promotion, including artificial insemination, "test tube" fertilization, surrogate motherhood and embryo transplantation
- acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and HIV infection.
- genetic knowledge: developments, applications and implications
PART II
REFERENCES

GENERALLY

Some journals often contain articles of medico-legal relevance. Among them are:

American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law Bulletin
American Journal of Law and Medicine
Columbia Human Rights Law Review
International Journal of Law and Psychiatry
Journal of Legal Medicine
Law and Human Behaviour
Legal Medical Quarterly
Medicine, Science and the Law
Medico-Legal Journal
Medicolegal News

ARTICLES

For convenience, articles are grouped under nine topic headings, but most articles are relevant to two or more headings. A brief definition of the types of articles under each topic heading is provided below. However, reference to a specific subject should not be confined only to one topic heading. Articles preceded by the notation [incl.] are included in these materials.

Topics
1. Standard of Care and Malpractice: general articles on medicine and the law; types of liability and duty; who may be liable for malpractice.
2. Consent: the modern law of "informed consent; substitute consent; right to refuse treatment (excluding life-saving treatment); rights of minors; experimentation
3. Confidentiality: access to medical records, immunity and privilege.
4. Right to Die: right to refuse life-saving treatment; euthanasia.
5. Mental Health: rights of the mentally incompetent; substitute consent; involuntary committal and sterilization; behaviour modification.
6. Genetics and Eugenics: policy proposals and legislation; population policy; "wrongful life" and "wrongful birth" actions.
7. Time Factors: Brain death; rights of the unborn; limitation periods.
9. Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS)
I. STANDARD OF CARE AND MALPRACTICE


5. R.J. Basil, "Clergy Malpractice: Taking Spiritual Counselling Conflicts Beyond Intentional Tort Analysis" 19(2) Rutgers Law J. 419-450.


21. T.K. Feng, "Failure of Medical Advice: Trespass or Negligence?" 7(2) Legal Studies 149-168.


41. R.C. Macaulay, Jr., "Health Care Cost Containment and Medical Malpractice: On a Collision Course" 21 Suffolk Univ. Law Rev. 91-118.


2.6


70. K. Terrel, "St. Elizabeth Hospital v. Garrard: Case Comment" 29(2) South Texas Law Rev. 461-486.

and Advertising Act and Preemption of Strict Liability in Tort Against Cigarette Manufacturers" 76(2) Kentucky Law J. 569-596.


Standard of Care: 1989/90 Supplement


3. K. Blaner, "Physician, Heal Thyself: Because the Cure, the Health Care Quality Improvement Act, May be worse than the Disease" 37(4) Catholic Univ. Law Rev. (Summer 1988) 1073-1112


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
2.9


Standard of Care: 1990/91 Supplement


2.12


2.13

**Standard of Care: 1991/92 Supplement**


2.15


2.17

**Standard of Care: 1992/93 Supplement**


60. I.B. Vertinsky and D.A. Wehrung, "Risk Perception and Drug Safety Evaluation" 2(4) Issues in Health & Safety (Fall 1991) 281-311.


II. CONSENT


Consent: 1989/90 Supplement


15. C. Kazin, "'Nowhere to Go and Choose to Stay': Using the Tort of False Imprisonment To Redress Involuntary Confinement of the Elderly in Nursing Homes and Hospitals" 137 (3) Univ. of Penn. Law Rev. (Jan. 1989) 903-927.


2.26


Consent: 1990/91 Supplement


20. D.B. Snyder, "Mother v. Fetus - The Case of 'Do or Die': In Re A.C."


Consent: 1991/92 Supplement


32. D.M. Oyler, "Interspousal Tort Liability for Infliction of a Sexually Transmitted Disease" 29(2) J. Family Law (1990/91) 519-537.


2.31


Consent: 1992/93 Supplement


11. J. Eekelaar, "The Importance of Thinking that Children Have Rights" 6(1) Int’l J. of Law and the Family (1992) 221-244.


III. CONFIDENTIALITY


11. B.S. Murphy, B.S., "How to Protect Employees Who are Tested for Drug and Alcohol Abuse" 33(1) The Practical Lawyer 27-40.


Confidentiality: 1989/90 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1990/91 Supplement


Confidentiality: 1991/92 Supplement


5. R. Slovenko, "The Therapist’s Duty to Warn or Protect Third Persons" J. Psychiatry & Law (Spring 1988) 139-209.


Confidentiality: 1992/93 Supplement


IV. RIGHT TO DIE


Right to Die: 1989/90 Supplement


18. G.P. Smith, "All's Well That Ends Well: Toward a Policy of Assisted Rational Suicide or Merely Enlightened Self-
2.41

Determination?" 22(2) Univ. of Calif. Davis Law Rev. (1989) 275-419.


Right to Die: 1990/91 Supplement


15. N. Hentoff, "The Church, the Law, and the Advancing Armies of Death" 33(1) Catholic Lawyer 1-11.


2.43


Right to Die: 1991/92 Supplement


2.46


Right to Die: 1992/93 Supplement


6. J.E. Bennett-Overton, "Unanswered Implications - The Clouded Rights of the Incompetent Patient Under Cruzan v. Director,


2.48


25. Y. Kamisar, "When is there a Constitutional 'Right to Die'? When there is No Constitutional 'Right to Live'?'" 25(5) Georgia Law Rev. (Summer 1991) 1203-1242.


27. J. Kevorkian, "A Fail-Safe Model for Justifiable Medically-Assisted Suicide ('Medicide')" 13(1) Amer. J. of Forensic Psychiatry (1992) 7-41. (Commentaries on Dr. Kevorkian’s Article infra, 43-81.)


V. MENTAL HEALTH


Mental Health: 1989/90 Supplement


**Mental Health: 1990/91 Supplement**


2.55


Mental Health: 1991/92 Supplement


Mental Health: 1992/93 Supplement


VI. GENETICS AND EUGENICS


Genetics and Eugenics: 1989/90 Supplement


30. R. Macklin, "Is There Anything Wrong with Surrogate Motherhood?: An Ethical Analysis" 16(1-2) Law, Med. & Health Care (1988) 57-64.


Genetics and Eugenics: 1990/91 Supplement


**Genetics and Eugenics: 1991/92 Supplement**


21. A. Jonet, "Legal Measures to Eliminate Transnational Trading of Infants for Adoption: An Analysis of Anti-Infant Trading


Genetics and Eugenics: 1992/93 Supplement


2. R. Boland, "Recent Developments in Abortion Law in Industrialized Countries" 18(4) Law, Med. & Health Care (Winter 1990) 404-418.


2.70

**VII. TIME FACTORS**


5. V.L. Bor, "Fetal Protection Policies & Title VII" 2(4) The Labor Lawyer 683-693.


26. C. Overall, "Pluck a Fetus from its Womb: A Critique of Current Attitudes Toward the Embryo/Fetus" 84(1) Univ. of Western Ont. Law Rev. 1-14.
2.72


Time Factors: 1989/90 Supplement


2.73


Time Factors: 1990/91 Supplement


2.76


**Time Factors: 1991/92 Supplement**


2.78


38. D.M. Korver, "The Constitutionality of Punishing Pregnant Substance Abusers Under Drug Trafficking Laws: The


49. C.L. Neff, "Woman, Womb and Bodily Integrity" 3(2) Yale J. Law & Feminism" (1991) 327-353.


VIII. BIOTECHNOLOGY


10. R.S. Eisenberg, "Proprietary Rights and the Norms of Science in Biotechnology Research" 97(2) Yale Law J. 177-231.


2.85


2.86


33. J. Taitz, "The Law Relating to the Consummation of Marriage where one of the Spouses is a Post Operative Transsexual" 15(2) Anglo-American Law Rev. 141-149.


Biotechnology: 1989/90 Supplement


Biotechnology: 1990/91 Supplement


2.94


53. J. Swaigen, "Negligence, Reverse Onuses and Environmental Offences: Some Practical Considerations" 2(2) J. of Environmental Law & Practice 149-188.

IX. ACQUIRED IMMUNODEFICIENCY SYNDROME (AIDS)


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1989/90 Supplement


2.104


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1990/91 Supplement


2.107


Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1991/92 Supplement


13. M.S. Cecere, "Working with AIDS" 16(4) Brief (Summer 1987) 6-42.


2.110


46. L.A. Polito, "Containing the AIDS Virus...Testing...Reporting...Confidentiality...Constitutional Considerations" 37(2) Cleveland State Law Rev. (1990) 369-392.


2.112


**Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome (AIDS): 1992/93 Supplement**


2.113


